Proposal Author & Title:

Reader:

## Part 1, Cursory checklist:

- Draft Status:
  - a complete draft, acceptable as a final draft
  - significant work, but not complete or deserves minor revisions
  - multiple problems obscure content and inhibit suggestions for improvement
- Impact:
  - SOLD: the motivation, problem, context, methods, & success criteria are clear. I'm convinced of the worthiness of the venture and the author's imminent success in this endeavor.
  - Maybe if you told me more... : topic is identified, but other elements are vague or omitted.
  - Not sold: I'm convinced the project should not progress beyond the proposal stage, or the text does not provide enough information for me to comment further.
- Section Structure:
  - each section well structured, with an overview &/or connection to the project as appropriate. the structure emphasizes important elements. information appears in the appropriate sections. appropriate use of tables and figures.
  - o overall structure is discernable, but deserves improvement
  - unclear structure in more than one section of the report or repeated organizational problems that interfere with the proposal's coherence.
- Paragraph Structure:
  - each paragraph is unified around a single topic. topic sentences are apt. information order and connectivity succeed. not too long, not too short.
  - paragraphs are understandable, but occasional problems with structure and connectivity persist
  - repeated problems at the paragraph level interfere with my understanding of this proposal.
- Sentence Structure & Word Choice:
  - o grammar, word choice, verb tense, pronouns all flawless
  - some re-occurring problems that do not interfere
  - sentence and word level problems interfere with my understanding of this proposal.
- Conflict of interest:
  - There IS a financial or other conflict of interest between your work and that of the author?
  - There IS NO financial or other conflict of interest between your work and that of the author?

## Part 2, Proposal-specific Information:

- Do what degree is the general problem clear & well argued?
- To what degree is the specific problem clear & well argued?
- Is the motivation clear? How important is the specific problem?
- Is the context clear? What is the relationship between the literature and the proposed project?
- Does the solution constitute a well thought out plan?
- Has the author demonstrated sufficient mastery of the subject matter to inspire confidence in his/her ability to complete this project?

## Part 3, What needs the most work:

• What are the strengths of the proposal?

• What are the weaknesses of the proposal that need to be addressed by the author within the next 10 days? As the reader, what else do you need to know to understand and evaluate this thesis project? What parts of the draft deserve further revision. What sort of revision is needed?